

UDC 366.14; 502.12 EDN: AANVXY
DOI: 10.24412/1995-042X-2022-2-24-39

Svetlana I. MISHULINA

*Federal Research Center the Subtropical Scientific Center of the Russian Academy of Sciences
(Sochi, Krasnodar Kray, Russia)*

PhD in Economics; e-mail: MISHULSV@yandex.ru

GREEN TRANSFORMATION OF CONSUMER BEHAVIOR MODEL IN TOURISM

Abstract. *Insights into the directions and factors for travelers consumer behavior green transformation influence not only the success of travel companies business models innovative green modernization, their market competitiveness, ability to adapt to changes in natural environment and climate, but also the possibility of creating effective mechanisms promoting green behavior of consumers and manufacturers as well as implementation of regional and national strategies, programs and plans for sustainable development. The research was aimed at developing a model for tourist product consumers green behavior as a tool for the tourist industry environmental transformation in the face of growing environmental risks and challenges. Based on the analysis of approaches existing in the national and foreign theoretical definition of the consumer behavior essence and modeling, the identification of factors and current trends in the consumer behavior green transformation, the author's definition of the tourist green behavior and factorial concept model for the tourist product consumer behavior green transformation are proposed. The research theoretical background includes national and foreign scientific papers on tourist product consumer behavior environmental transformation, determining conditions and ways for the transition to a 'green' economic growth, and sustainable development of the tourist industry. The research data background includes analytical and statistical reports of international tourist and nature protection institutions, governmental and nongovernmental analytical centers, governmental statistical service official data, the data of tourist market entities surveys, published case studies, including the analysis of tourist market entities activities. Applied methods of informational monitoring and analysis of national and international scientific databases, systemic analysis, synthesis, patterns identification allowed to make reasonable conclusions.*

The publication was prepared under the implementation of issue No 1021052404499-3-5.2.1 Theoretical and methodological foundations for the strategic management of the RF recreational and tourist sector innovative development of the FRC SSC RAS state assignment.

Keywords: *tourist industry; sustainable development; 'green' economy; tourist 'green' behavior; tourist product 'green' consumer behavior model.*



Citation: Mishulina, S. I. (2022). Green transformation of consumer behavior model in tourism. *Servis v Rossii i za rubezhom [Services in Russia and Abroad]*, 16(2), 24–39. doi: 10.24412/1995-042X-2022-2-24-39.

Article History

Received 10 February 2022

Accepted 11 April 2022

Disclosure statement

No potential conflict of interest was reported by the author(s).



© 2022 the Author(s)

This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International (CC BY-SA 4.0).

To view a copy of this license, visit <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/>

МИШУЛИНА Светлана Ивановна

*Федеральный исследовательский центр «Субтропический научный центр
Российской академии наук» (Сочи, Краснодарский край, РФ)
кандидат экономических наук; e-mail: MISHULSV@yandex.ru*

ЗЕЛЕНАЯ ТРАНСФОРМАЦИЯ МОДЕЛИ ПОВЕДЕНИЯ ПОТРЕБИТЕЛЯ ТУРИСТСКОГО ПРОДУКТА

От глубины понимания направлений и факторов зеленой трансформации модели потребительского поведения путешественников зависит не только успешность инновационной зеленой модернизации бизнес-моделей туристических компаний, их конкурентоспособность на рынке, способность адаптироваться к изменениям ОПС и климата, но и возможности формирования эффективных механизмов стимулирования зеленого поведения потребителя и производителя и реализации региональных и национальных стратегий, программ и планов устойчивого развития. Целью работы явилась разработка модели зеленого поведения потребителей туристского продукта как инструмента экологической трансформации индустрии туризма в условиях роста экологических рисков и вызовов. В результате анализа существующих в отечественной и зарубежной теории подходов к определению сущности и моделированию поведения потребителя, выявления факторов и современных тенденций зеленой трансформации поведения потребителя предложены авторское определение зеленого поведения туриста и факторная концепт-модель зеленой трансформации поведения потребителя туристского продукта. Теоретическую и информационную базу исследования составили труды отечественных и зарубежных ученых по проблемам экологически ориентированной трансформации поведения потребителей туристского продукта, определению условий и путей перехода на модель «зеленого» экономического роста и устойчивого развития индустрии туризма. Информационную базу исследования составили аналитические и статистические отчеты международных туристских и природоохранных организаций, правительственных и некоммерческих аналитических центров, официальные данные государственной службы статистики, материалы опросов субъектов туристского рынка, опубликованные кейсы, включающие анализ практической деятельности субъектов туристского рынка. Используемые в исследовании методы информационного мониторинга и анализа отечественных и международных научных баз данных, системного анализа и синтеза, выявления закономерностей, позволили сделать обоснованные выводы.

Публикация подготовлена в рамках реализации темы №1021052404499-3-5.2.1 «Теоретико-методологические основы стратегического управления инновационным развитием рекреационно-туристской сферы РФ» ГЗ ФИЦ СЦ РАН.

Ключевые слова: индустрия туризма; устойчивое развитие; «зеленая» экономика; «зеленое» поведение туриста; модель «зеленого» поведения потребителя туристского продукта



Для цитирования: Мишулина С.И. Зеленая трансформация модели поведения потребителя туристского продукта // Сервис в России и за рубежом. 2022. Т.16. №2. С. 24–39. DOI: 10.24412/1995-042X-2022-2-24-39.

Дата поступления в редакцию: 10 февраля 2022 г.

Дата утверждения в печать: 11 апреля 2022 г.

Introduction

Tourist consumer behavior is considered one of the most researched issues. Nevertheless, in the last 5 years, there has been a significant increase in publications on this issue in the general array of articles on sustainable tourism [25], which is explained not only by the dynamic development of the tourist industry, the growth of its role in the global economy and the scale of negative impact on natural environment, but also significant environmentally driven changes in consumer behavior that need to be researched.

Effective environmental transformation of travel companies business models requires a deep understanding of current consumer behavior changes and trends, and how they will evolve in the future. Companies that lack this understanding and do not take steps to adapt to the new reality will become non-competitive.

At the same time, there is a growing awareness that it is impossible to solve the problems of transition to green economic growth only through technological innovations without consumers active involvement in the restructuring processes for the relationship between society and the environment. This approach involves synchronization of production processes and business models (BM) innovative 'greening' with the processes of consumer behavior models 'greening' (CBM), which requires a deep understanding of the essence, development logics and factors that determine the direction and dynamics of the CBM green transformation.

However, despite the growth in the number of studies and publications in this area, the authors note their obvious limitations and fragmentation. So, for example, only about 4% of articles contain the research insights on consumer behavior concerning the travel companies 'green' offer in the total array of articles on sustainable tourism development [25]. It is premature to talk about the existence of sustainable consumer behavior (SCB) coherent theory, although there has been a trend towards separating SCB into an independent theoretical structure within the last three years.

The purpose of this research is to build a model for tourist green behavior based on its identified development factors and analysis of the tourist product consumers response to their impact.

Issues of greening tourist CBM and travel companies BM are relevant for a wide range of stakeholders, including the local community and business structures of destinations, national and foreign investors, local authorities, regional and national bodies interested in the sustainable development of tourism, and specialized tourist areas, and make relevant the research of this topic. The research findings will contribute to an effective incentives system development and overcoming barriers to regional and municipal sustainable development strategies implementation.

Theoretical approaches to determining tourist green behavior

Consumer behavior is considered one of the most studied key marketing categories, however, sustainable consumer behavior is underresearched and has fragmentary nature [38].

No generally accepted definition of environmentally sustainable or responsible consumer behavior (ESCB and ERCB) has been developed to date, as well as instrumental terminology for the concept of environmentally responsible consumer behavior. Sustainable, responsible, environmentally sustainable, environmentally responsible, environmentally conscious, green consumer behavior, socially responsible, environmentally friendly consumer behavior are often used interchangeably [34]. Recently, in addition to the above terms, the phrase 'pro-environmental consumer behavior' [29, 35, 39] is often used, understood as behavior, which is usually (or following environmental knowledge) assessed in the context of the society in question as a protective way of environmental behavior or a tribute to a healthy environment [35]. It is emphasized that pro-environmental behavior is a heterogeneous, multidimensional construction, including behavior in both private and public spheres [29]. Close in meaning is, in our opinion, the concept of environmentally oriented behavior, applicable both to

consumer behavior and to business structures activities.

Despite the abundance and variety of terms used, they are united by their inherent principle of minimizing negative environmental consequences of consumption. For broader concepts of sustainable and socially responsible consumer behavior, it is supplemented by ethics, sociability, and efficiency (resource efficiency) principles [7].

Environmentally sustainable consumer behavior (ESCB) is associated with environmentally responsible behavior and is an umbrella concept that reflects consumer actions aimed at ensuring the environmental aspects of sustainable development [34]. Some researchers have a broad understanding of ESCB as human behavior that contributes to environmental sustainability [32]. The same approach is followed by authors who study the environmental aspects of socially responsible consumer behavior [38]. A similar approach is applied in tourism: A sustainable tourist is a tourist who is highly committed to adhering to the principles of sustainable development during leisure (travel) [40].

In contrast to a broad understanding that includes economic, social, and cultural aspects of environmental responsibility, some authors limit environmentally responsible behavior (ERCB) to resource saving [34].

Consumer responsibility (social, environmental) assumes considering social (and environmental) and resulting socio-economic consequences of their private consumption and considering consumption as the manifestation of responsible citizenship [38]. From this point of view, the decision to refuse consumption to reduce negative impact on natural environment is also a form of private environmentally friendly behavior manifestation [23], while participation in protests against manufacturers which negatively impact natural environment is considered its public form.

Consumer behavior, in our opinion, is not limited to their activities as customers. It is broader, as it includes not only the choice and purchase of a product but also the consumption and disposal process of its results, which can have different environmental features and consequences for sustainable development. At the same time, if the purchase (or rejection of it), while influencing the level and quality of consumption, is nevertheless a tool for consumer influence on manufacturer/seller behavior, then private consumption and disposal processes represent a direct impact of the consumer on natural environment.

Heesup Han fairly believes that green consumer behavior (GCB) covers all forms of consumer behavior that are useful in reducing negative impact on natural environment [33].

Studies of consumer behavior in tourism apply the concepts of 'tourist behavior' or 'traveler behavior' [27]. This approach is quite legitimate in our opinion since travel involves a continuous consumption process of complementary goods and services that satisfy the standard (basic) and specific needs of a tourist/traveler.

Based on the definition of sustainable development, international organizations define responsible (sustainable) tourism in their documents as "tourism that maximizes benefits for local communities, minimizes negative social or environmental impacts and contributes to the preservation of fragile cultures and habitats"¹.

Passafaro P. and co-authors propose the following definition for sustainable tourist behavior (STB) – behavior that considers climatic, economic, social, and environmental consequences of recreation options choice, which possibly reduces the carbon footprint or compensates for it [40]. Such an understanding of STB presupposes the consumer knowledge and commitment to the principles of sustainable development², their

¹ The Case for Responsible Travel: Trends & Statistics 2020. Special edition: Lessons from COVID-19 for tourism in a changing climate (2020). URL: <https://www.responsibletravel.org/> (Accessed on October 7, 2021).

² Meanwhile, CREST (Center for Responsible Travel) studies of 2019 state that only 15% of tourists who participated in the USA surveys understand the meaning of sustainable travel, whereas 50% of them are 18 to 34 years old/ The Case for Responsible Travel: Trends & Statistics 2020. Special edition: Lessons from COVID-19 for tourism in a changing climate.

understanding of the carbon footprint essence and its background processes, the availability of quantitative assessments for both the carbon footprint for certain types of consumer activities and the tourist's contribution to its development when choosing alternative recreation options, the conviction in one's own ability to contribute to its reduction, as well as the availability of choice, i.e. includes not only the behavior as such but also a series of factors that determine it. The proposed approach is more consistent with the understanding of consumer behavior as a *generalized concept for the factors and processes* that determine consumer economic actions in the context of goods acquisition and consumption [13]. However, its legitimacy raises doubts, since behavior (as a set of actions) and the factors that determine it are not the same things. Identifying influencing factors, analyzing their relationship nature and the degree of influence on consumer behavior remains a serious scientific issue for various disciplines and an obligatory stage in the development of consumer behavior models.

Russian researchers use the concept of tourist environmentally responsible behavior, which is understood as "... valuable behavior sensemaking based on the high importance of nature for the individual and care for it, the desire not to harm" [12, p. 96]. Environmentally responsible behavior, according to the authors, is manifested not only in the choice of a tourist product that meets environmental requirements but also in conscious behavior during travel that has a positive impact on natural environment and tourists as well.

In this research, to refer to the environmentally oriented or environmentally friendly behavior of a tourist/traveler as a consumer, the concept of green tourist behavior (GTB) is used, which is proposed to be understood as behavior that suggests taking into account the

environmental consequences of actions (following the knowledge level of possible consequences) carried out by the tourist at all stages of the consumption process (need identification, information search, purchase decision, purchase, consumption, and disposal) of all tourist product components.

Such a definition implies a tourist's understanding of possible consequences of the decisions made, or a clear social codification of environmentally acceptable behavior norms. Moreover, according to this definition, the same behavior will be environmentally acceptable for one consumer and not environmentally friendly for the other if the latter has a broader knowledge of the environment and adjust their behavior accordingly. Nevertheless, it firstly implies the inclusion of environmental responsibility factor in all consumer behavior components (the presence of goodwill to reduce one's pressure on natural environment), and secondly, it reflects the dynamic character of tourist consumer behavior environmental features, depending on environmental issues severity, corresponding knowledge transformation, and social norms.

It should be noted that environmental consequences of consumption can be significant (and considered as such) both for the consumers themselves (primarily for their health) and for natural environment as more general consequences of private consumption. The use of the GTB concept in this research involves the inclusion of all private and public consequences of tourist consumer behavior.

Traditionally, green consumption activities include a choice of environmentally friendly products, resource saving, waste reduction, and sorting, use of environmentally friendly transport, etc., i.e. all forms of consumer activities that help reducing negative impact on natural environment. In tourism, this is an awareness of the need

URL: <https://www.responsibletravel.org/> (Accessed on October 7, 2021). Studies of Booking.com are more encouraging: 50% of travelers know how to travel sustainably, but 36% of them believe they can't afford it. Booking.com. (April 17, 2019). Booking.com reveals key findings from its 2019 sustainable travel report. URL: <https://globalnews.booking.com/bookingcom-reveals-keyfindings-from-its-2019-sustainable-travel-report/> (Accessed on October 27, 2021). In 2017, 72% of tourists in Russia never heard about sustainable tourism concept or have heard, but never tried to go into the meaning of it [9].

(perception of natural environment as an enduring value, avoiding environmental problems in the place of permanent residence; new experiences or outdoor recreation activities in environmentally favorable conditions); environmentally oriented choice of destination, for example, not visiting a destination suffering from overtourism, or the choice of environmental tourist destinations; sustainable types of transport (including transport-free choice in favor of hiking); green accommodation facilities (including sharing economy facilities); green cruises, restaurants, and cafes; consumption of locally produced organic products; saving electricity and water during travel, minimizing food and non-recyclable waste (plastic); separate waste collection; reuse of towels, water containers; leasing and rental of special tourist equipment instead of purchasing, participation in environmental campaigns during travel, etc. One cannot but agree with the authors who believe that a peculiar feature of GTB is not only the consumption of green goods and services during travel but also the willingness of green tourists for self-restriction to reduce negative impact on natural environment, mainly in terms of comfort [11].

Modeling tourist green behavior

In marketing, consumer behavior (CB) is understood as a set of internally interconnected actions carried out by the subject in interaction with the environment (marketing environment) to meet the needs through the purchase and consumption of goods and services. That is, CB is perceived as a consumer's reaction to the impact of various internal and external stimuli. Accordingly, CB modeling is the identification and analysis of the relationship within a system of economic, social, environmental, and psychological factors that characterize the needs and ways to meet them [8, p.140].

A.V. Zemskov and V.N. Bugorsky understand the behavior model of services consumer as a description (more or less formalized) of the

relationship between human activity (considered both as a socio-psychological object and as a consumer of goods) and those motives (needs and desires) that lie behind these actions, as well as the properties of the consumer's personality (and the state of the external environment in which these actions are performed) [6, p.184].

In the most general sense, the GTB model, in our opinion, is a conditional image of environmentally responsible tourists, reflecting the essential features of their behavior at various stages of the consumption process for tourist product components, determined by their perception of environmental issues and their ability to influence their decisions during travel.

Modeling involves analysis of the conditions in which the tourist will be, the definition of the main model units, and factors influencing the environmental friendliness of the tourist's behavior

The authors use universal CBMs, adapting them to the research purposes, for example, a widely used consumer decision-making model by R. Blackwell [2]. Or, they offer their own, designed to solve specific research issues. The model proposed by Mary Justin Amonoy et al. to identify and explain the impact of environmental knowledge, values, and attitudes on the green behavior of Generation Z consumers could serve as an example of such a CBM [23]. Another example is the tourist behavior models that reflect the tourist industry digital transformation, proposed by researchers at the Higher School of Economics³.

There are two basic approaches to structuring a GTB model:

- analytical, within the framework of which a basic generalized model is built, including a set of predetermined (identified during the preliminary analysis) factors, which is then adapted to a specific group of consumers-tourists, for example, the Generation Z GTB model;

- simulating, built on identifying behavior patterns of various tourists groups, which

³ Domestic tourism. Impact of the pandemic on the tourist industry (2019). URL: hse.ru/mirror/pubs/share/433402486.pdf (Accessed on November 7, 2021).

involves conducting large-scale sociological surveys, collecting, and processing large volumes of data (big data).

The multi-level structure and its complexity, as well as complicated interactions of all the factors forming environmental needs and causing behavioral responses determine the integrity, complexity, and consistency of green consumer behavior. Obviously, it cannot be fully disclosed within the framework of any single scientific theory or model and requires an integrated interdisciplinary approach.

Many pieces of research use the so-called 'black box' model (a simple consumer behavior model) as a baseline, considering the consumer's consciousness as a 'black box' that gives rise to customer responses under the influence of motivator and marketing stimuli (for example, purchase or refusal to purchase).

More complex models expand the set of stimuli, supplementing them with political, social, technological, cultural, etc. ones. It should be noted that environmental factors appeared in this list relatively recently, primarily to analyze consumers reaction to the companies' efforts to green their products and activities, including green marketing (environmental management, products and services 'green' certification, corporate social responsibility (CSR), compliance with ESG criteria⁴, disclosed reporting, etc.) [27, 38]. The 'black box' content is structured simultaneously, for example, by including the socio-psychological features and values of customers, as well as their responses.

Some universal theories form the theoretical background for the models under development, among which are the marginal utility theory, the neoclassical theory of rational consumer behavior, the theory of planned behavior, the value-belief-norm theory, the theory of reasoned action, the norm activation theory, and other social psychology and environmental sociology

theories, which make it possible to consider the influence of personality-psychological factors, values, and beliefs in models.

Modern implementations of these theories try to integrate into them the factors that determine consumers green behavior. The greatest attention is paid to climate change impacts on consumer behavior [30, 41]. In tourism, climate change impact is analyzed mainly from the perspective of a climate-related decrease in destinations attractiveness (reduction of snow cover at ski resorts, melting of glaciers as attraction objects, water bloom and jellyfish invasion, anomalous air and water temperatures, coral bleaching, increase of natural hazards, etc.). It is noted that the difficulties in predicting climate change cause difficulties in modeling and predicting consumer behavior.

Another major part of research covers consumer behavior transformation as a response to the companies' 'green' efforts (compliance with sustainability principles, integration of SDGs, CSR, ESG into the development strategies) [14, 26].

Recently, there has been an increase in research devoted to modeling the consumer response to the green transformation of intrapersonal factors: values, attitudes, norms [29, 32].

The fragmentation of GTB models research noted by the authors is explained, first, by the fact that usually individual influence factors (one-factor, two-factor, three-factor models) are studied, the addition or recombination of which leads to contradictory results. Moreover, the research findings of the same factors influence can be incomparable when the tourist destinations and tourist types change that prevents their generalization⁵.

Another limitation is the static nature of GTB proposed models, which does not consider its transformations over time. Issues are also caused by the reduction of the research field to

⁴ ESG (Environmental, Social and Corporate Governance) criteria – criteria used by investors and rating agencies to assess the involvement of companies in solving environmental, social and management issues.

⁵ Some research indicate that the level of consumer behavior environmental friendliness of the British and Germans decreases for the travels to the South of Europe [24].

specific goods and services (environmentally friendly products, 'green' hotels, organic products, etc.). A fixed set of major stimuli and a certain type of environmentally friendly products limit the proposed models application [19, 23].

The complexity of green consumer behavior research in tourism is determined by specifics of tourist product production and consumption. For example, by continuous consumption of various complementary goods and services during travel that makes up a combination of habitual consumption items, which however can change (for example, food, hygiene products, etc.) and specific tourist goods, which sometimes could not be analyzed as a whole or separately from the travel process and could be at the same time environmentally friendly to varying degrees.

The GTB analysis is further complicated by many macroeconomic and political factors impacts, the effect of which can only partially be offset by such features as adaptability and travel variability. A vivid example is the tourist behavior impacted by visa and sanitary restrictions introduced to prevent the spread of Covid-19. While middle- and low-income population groups were forced to refrain from traveling, high-income groups sought to ensure the safety of their travels (including environmental safety) using private jets, renting chalets and villas located in hard-to-reach unique natural areas (not excluding protected areas), etc.

Some authors explain the fragmentation of GTB studies by the improper use of theories, concepts, models, and methods in tourist behavior analysis borrowed from other disciplines and research areas without their adaptation to the tourist industry, including general studies of consumer behavior in marketing [1, 36].

Only a few studies use systemic holistic approaches to understand the behavior or processes under study [27]. It can be stated with a high degree of confidence that there is no universal model yet, which explains the relationship and mutual influence of factors, and their impact on GTB. In addition, some authors question the feasibility of developing a universal model [27]. Given

the complex complementary nature of the tourist product, where every component consumed is characterized by significant differences, presence of serious differences in its consumption conditions, complex and multidirectional influence of social, psychological, economic, environmental, and other factors, we should agree with the expediency of developing a system of GTB models, each of which performs its function in learning GTB development and implementation processes.

Green transformation of tourism consumer behavior

Recently, a lot of research covers the environmentally oriented transformation of consumer behavior under the influence of external factors caused by a significant deterioration of natural environment, climate change, emergence and spread of pathogens, and pandemics [17, 20, 31]. There is a rapidly growing volume of research on the changes that occur in the behavioral patterns of travelers under the influence of COVID-19 [4, 15, 39]. At the same time, there is an increase in research of internal factors (psychological, personal) that determine the motivation for green consumer behavior of various tourists categories.

The authors note that the motivation for travel and the factor that determines its format and choice of direction is health safety and the search for ways to transform the lifestyle, giving it a new meaning, ensuring harmony with inner self and the environment. Preference is given to a tourist product that promotes a healthy lifestyle and immune stimulation, reassessment of the nature role [15].

These trends are confirmed by the global research findings of consumer behavior among Russians for 2020, held in 2019-2020 by analytical company PwC. One of the main trends identified in a survey held after the pandemic outbreak is an increase in attention to physical and mental health and well-being (69%) [16].

Many authors and tourism practitioners consider the greening of tourist behavioral patterns not as an emerging trend, but as a sustainable trend, which is largely facilitated by the results of surveys held regularly by large search

aggregators, such as Booking.com and TripAdvisor, as well as analytical companies. For example, studies by STR (Smith Travel Research) show a steady increase in the number of tourists who feel responsible for their negative impact on natural environment during travel. According to the latest (2021) studies by Booking.com, 72% of Russians surveyed believe that decisive action is needed right now to save the planet, 57% say that because of the pandemic they want to travel more consciously in the future⁶. Survey data indicate a positive trend in traveler environmental preferences (Table 1).

Table 1 – Dynamics of travelers environmental preferences while choosing accommodation establishments⁷

Share of travelers planning to book eco-housing, %	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020
	62	65	68	73	82

In Russia, the share of tourists wishing to stay in sustainable accommodation establishments comprised 74% in 2021 showing a significant increase compared to 2016 (62%)⁸.

At the same time, there is a point of view according to which GTB is not a long-term and sustainable trend, but a tribute to fashion [19]. And consumption of environmentally friendly goods and services is motivated by consumption enjoyment and not by care about natural environment and the future of the planet. To describe such behavior, the term 'joyful consumption' appeared in English-language literature. Russian authors propose to name environmental hedonists

those who prioritize their comfort in combination with personal environmental safety (the choice of glamping or a secluded chalet in a protected area for accommodation) [19, p.105].

To be fair, there is another type of ecological hedonist. Many representatives of Generation Z - 'joyful consumption' followers enjoy rationalizing and minimizing their consumption, releasing from the stereotypes of the consumer society. In tourism, an example of minimalistic consumption can be the choice of an eco-friendly hostel for accommodation or the use of digital platforms that allow free use of accommodation services. Abandoning ownership in favor of more efficient use of real estate (sharing economy as a tool for increasing resource efficiency)⁹. 56% of Russian ecotourists declare their readiness to limit the amenities use to reduce negative impact on natural environment during travel [10].

From the point of view of reducing negative impact on natural environment, tourist motivation is not so important (it does not matter what guides, it is important how one behaves). In this case, the concept of pleasure is of fundamental importance.

Increasing environmental concerns and understanding that it is necessary to take urgent measures to preserve natural environment, unfortunately, do not mean the increase of real consumer activity in this direction.

In 2019, only 10% of travelers in Europe considered sustainability issues when choosing travel options [25].

In Russia, a study of tourist behavior when choosing protected areas as a tourist destination

⁶ Booking.com. Sustainable Travel Report 2021. (2021). URL: <https://www.sustainability.booking.com/post/booking-com-s-2021-sustainable-travel-report-affirms-potential-watershed-moment> (Accessed on October 3, 2021).

⁷ Compiled by the author based on Booking.com reports on sustainable travel. The study includes the results of an on-line survey of 18,077 respondents from 18 regional markets. In 2020 – on-line survey of 20 432 respondents in 22 markets. Booking.com. (April 17, 2019). Booking.com reveals key findings from its 2019 sustainable travel report. URL: <https://globalnews.booking.com/bookingcom-reveals-keyfindings-from-its-2019-sustainable-travel-report/> (Accessed on October, 27, 2021).; Booking.com. Sustainable Travel Report 2021. URL: <https://www.sustainability.booking.com/post/booking-com-s-2021-sustainable-travel-report-affirms-potential-watershed-moment> (Accessed on October 3, 2021).

⁸ Booking.com on responsible travel in 2021 and major changes for travellers. URL: www.turpressa.com (Accessed on October 3, 2021).

⁹ Most popular among such platforms – Couchsurfing.com – community of 12 mln people from more than 200,000 cities; Homestay.com; Homeexchange.com, etc.

showed that even in the ecotourists category, the share of those possessing environmentally responsible behavior is 26% [12].

A major barrier to GTB development is the way consumers perceive environmental issues. If problems are perceived only as general (social), the possibility of their solution by one person is excluded, there is a temptation to shift responsibility to society, which reduces incentives to change one's behavior. Differences in a sense of responsibility perception lead to different behavioral patterns. In practice, this issue manifests itself in the discrepancy between the increase in the sense of responsibility declared by consumers and the low level of willingness to pay for green solutions¹⁰.

Thus, according to the results of Russians consumer behavior global study¹¹ held in 2020 by the audit company PwC, which also analyzes environmental risks, 80% (2019 - 83%) of Russians are concerned about environmental issues, but only 47% (declare readiness) are ready to pay more for environmental goods or sacrifice comfort for the sake of responsibility and environmental habits training. 47% expect businesses to be responsible for their impact on natural environment (i.e., they shift the responsibility on business) [16].

Evidence of consumer unwillingness to pay for the economy greening are the mass protests of the population in France, England, Spain, and other countries associated with increasing fuel and energy prices. Residents of the United States are not ready to switch to public transport en masse [21].

G. Miniero with co-authors believes that the conflict between the obligation to preserve natural environment towards society and future generations and short-term obligations towards oneself and one's family does not contribute to greening behavior, and willingness to follow GCB expressed in surveys does not mean appropriate consumer actions. In other words, the growth in

the importance of green products for the consumer, recorded by sociological studies, does not lead to a corresponding increase in their sales [37]. In Russia, 88% are not ready to pay more, even if they are sure that the manufacturing company follows the CBR principles [5].

Analysis of the European consumer behavioral patterns shows that being aware of green concepts, they are not ready to pay more for green products, since their value is not obvious, or may appear in the distant future. Therefore, for the GCB model to be realistic, it should include the factors for willingness to pay and the level of trust or belief in the value of green goods and services, as well as factors reflecting the value of nature and a sense of responsibility for natural environment. This in turn requires a corresponding transformation of business models, both in terms of greening the offer value and in terms of communications that provide evidence of such value to consumers [28].

Summarizing the findings of research on trends in the environmentally oriented transformation of tourist product consumer behavior in recent years allows us to propose a conceptual model for the green transformation of the tourist consumer behavior presented in Table 2. R. Blackwell's model of the consumer decision-making process was chosen as the basis [2].

Conclusion

The proposed model is conceptual and is not intended to be exhaustive in revealing all environmental factors of GTB. Moreover, the analysis of environmental factors influence on GTB features in isolation from other (social, psychological, etc.) influence factors is a serious model limitation. Nevertheless, it meets the analysis goals and allows to identify a set of factors determining GTB processes and further develop a system of state and public measures promoting the green transformation of the tourist product consumer behavior.

Depending on the analysis goals, the model

¹⁰ In some countries, the share of consumers who are willing to pay more, even if they are sure that the manufacturer adheres to CSR principles, is only 12% [5].

¹¹ The survey was held in two stages: before the outbreak of COVID-19 and after. Residents of large cities with a population of more than 1 million people participated in the survey.

can be supplemented with both newly emerging influence factors, including those generated by the efforts of management institutions at all levels, and new forms of green behavior manifestation emerging as a response to new environmental challenges and green transformation of travel

companies business models. The possibility to expand the model with a correlation analysis outcome for the relationship between various influence factors (not only environmental ones) and the relative response of tourist product consumers determines directions for future research.

Table 2 – Green transformation model of tourist consumer behavior

<i>Environmental influence factors</i>	<i>Stages of the tourist decision-making process</i>	<i>Green tourist behavior</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Increasing the value of clean natural environment as a rare good; Perception of deteriorating natural environment as a threat to health and life; Increasing environmental consciousness and sense of responsibility for the future of the planet; Reinterpretation of consumption: transition to a resource-saving lifestyle; the need for a change in lifestyle, downshifting¹², following healthy lifestyle¹³; technological changes in consumption strategies [3]; developing green consumption skills in everyday life. 	Awareness of the need (recognition problems solved during travel, determining the purpose of travel)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The choice of tourism types and directions associated with clean natural environment: ecological, rural, nature tourism¹⁴, fitness and yoga tours, multi-day trekking tours¹⁵; refusal to travel to environmentally unfriendly destinations or as a way to reduce one's negative impact; refusal to go on short long-distance trips in favor of a long stay in one place with the replacement of car trips with hiking trips (visiting protected areas); reorientation to domestic tourism to reduce risks.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Increase of awareness on environment status, biodiversity, and climate, the role of various activities in environmental issues aggravation; increase in the level of environmental education; implementation of social and governmental measures to disclose environmental information; 	Information search	<p>Information search:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> on destinations environmental features; accommodation establishments and various types of transport; attractions; on the carbon footprint of various tourist activities; on the alternatives to meet the needs during travel, provided by the sharing

¹² Changing consumption patterns and lifestyles, abandoning high-paying career growth in favor of lower material consumption and stress levels, but a higher quality of life and personal satisfaction (abandoning a career in favor of a dream), as a result of the concept transformation for success and happiness associated with harmonious coexistence with society and nature.

¹³ Booking.com 2021 study reveals a new trend in traveler motivation: 88% of travelers view travel as a form of self-care. Booking.com. Sustainable Travel Report 2021. URL: <https://www.sustainability.booking.com/post/booking-com-s-2021-sustainable-travel-report-affirms-potential-watershed-moment> (Accessed on October 3, 2021).

¹⁴ For example, 2021 surveys of American tourists show that the top travel motives in 2021 are getting away from the crowds (57.6%) and enjoying nature (53.1%) The Case for Responsible Travel: Trends & Statistics 2020. Special edition: Lessons from COVID-19 for tourism in a changing climate (2020). URL: <https://www.responsibletravel.org/> (Accessed on October 7, 2021). In Russia, the number of visitors to ecological trails and routes in national parks has almost doubled from 1,906,003 people in 2015 to 3,773,692 people in 2020 [rosstat.gov.ru]. According to WCIOM data for 2021, 63% of Russians called nature the most interesting tourism option [22].

¹⁵ For example, trekking tours "The Pilgrim's Trail": Routes of St. James in Spain - Portugal, France with a length of 90 to 960 km; Southwest Coast Trail (UK) – 1016 km and some others.

<i>Environmental influence factors</i>	<i>Stages of the tourist decision-making process</i>	<i>Green tourist behavior</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> disclosed environmental reporting of companies; green marketing of tourist market participants; tourists blogs and reviews, other Internet resources; development of digital travel planning services. 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> economy; leasing, renting, availability of used inventory and equipment; on the options to participate in environmental campaigns during travel and options of environmental rehabilitation on the impact caused during travel.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Development of international and national systems for environmental assessment criteria and tools for various activities impacts; arrangement and development of digital services for assessing one's impact on natural environment (for example, online travel carbon footprint calculators); development of institutions for products and services green certification, eco-labeling; inclusion of goods and services environmental features in offers promoted by travel companies and platforms. 	Pre-purchase alternatives assessment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Forming pre-purchase green consumer expectations; including environmental features in assessment criteria; comparing environmental and economic costs, risks, and benefits at all stages of travel; searching for a compromise between the environmental and economic parameters of the purchases tourist product components; assessing the possibility of changing the travel format to reduce negative impact (carbon footprint), including consumption reduction: refusal of non-environmentally friendly directions and transport, reorientation to domestic tourism, refusal of holiday splitting and long flights, purchasing tickets for direct flights.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Developing environmentally friendly, green sales channels; digital platforms; increasing companies attention to the search for new communication options with environmentally responsible consumers; increasing the range and production volumes of tourism green goods and services; greening the activities of tour operators and travel agents. 	Purchase	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Independent tourist product formation by booking on digital platforms, aggregators, websites of tourist goods and services suppliers in compliance with the environmental criteria established by the tourist¹⁶; purchasing green tourist goods and services: environmentally friendly transport (public transport, bicycles, electric vehicles, walking routes, etc.), green accommodation establishments, green cruises; services and goods of local manufacturers, organic food.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Availability of green proposal for integrated complementary tourist product components; ensuring production environmental safety throughout the entire chain while creating 	Consumption	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Green goods and services consumption; support for environmental initiatives of service providers;

¹⁶ In Russia, 70% of tourists plan and form a tourist product independently, choosing suppliers. Domestic tourism. Impact of the pandemic on the tourist industry. (2019). URL: hse.ru/mirror/pubs/share/433402486.pdf (Accessed on November 7, 2021).

<i>Environmental influence factors</i>	<i>Stages of the tourist decision-making process</i>	<i>Green tourist behavior</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> an integrated tourist product (involving all tourist market participants, including tourists, in these processes); introduction of green technologies, CSR principles, GSTC criteria¹⁷, green standards by tourist companies; development of green infrastructure that ensures green consumer activities in the course of the tourist product consumption; availability of policies and practices for destination sustainable development; increasing activities of the local community and other tourism stakeholders on the issues of destinations sustainable development. 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> consumption under the 3R concept: reduce, reuse, recycle; participation in sharing economy programs as a consumer; participation in international, national, regional, and local environmental events and promotions during travel; compliance with international, national, regional, and local green norms and regulations during travel.
<p>Presence of formal and informal institutions for assessing the environmental friendliness of consumer behavior.</p> <p>Coding social norms for green consumer behavior.</p> <p>Developing digital services to exchange travel reviews.</p>	Assessment based on consumption results	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Comparing pre-purchase expectations to consumption results; assessing the compliance level of travel results and solution of problems identified in the first stage; assessing the satisfaction level with environmental features of consumption throughout the travel (compliance with the environmental criteria established by the consumer) through their own experience and own development; assessing the travel compliance level with a new lifestyle; forming own green image; the sense of belonging and pride; distributing one's own positive/negative experience of travel ecologization - reviews in social networks, on the websites of service providers, and on specialized websites; forming green consumption skills in tourism (green routines); forming loyalty towards green products and companies.
<p>Developing reuse, recycle programs at international, national, regional, and local levels, relevant digital services, and infrastructure;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> developing tourist services for tools and equipment rental and leasing; developing sharing economy. 	Exemption	<p>Participating in activities for wastes separate collection and disposal.</p> <p>Participating in sharing economy programs as a resource supplier.</p> <p>Selling, transferring tourist equipment and tools, guidebooks</p>

¹⁷ Global Sustainable Tourism Council GSTC standards – basic sustainable tourism standards. Used to assess green efforts of companies, as well as to educate and raise consumer awareness of the tourism product. Developed both for individual tourism service providers (hotels) and for destinations.

References

1. Abdunurova, A. A. (2019). Teoreticheskie koncepcii povedeniya potrebitel'ev v turizme [Theoretical concepts of consumer behavior in tourism]. *Central Asian Economic Review*, 4, 180-192. (In Russ.).
2. Blackwell, R. D., Miniard, P. W., & Engel, J. F. (2007). *Povedenie potrebitel'ev [Consumer behavior]: A monograph*. St.Petersburg: Piter. (In Russ.).
3. Gordienko, S. V. (2021). Tekhnologicheskie izmeneniya strategij potrebleniya v sovremennom turizme [Technological changes in consumption strategies in modern tourism]. *Ekonomicheskie strategii [Economic Strategies]*, 23(1/175), 128-135. doi: 10.33917/es-1.175.2021.128-135. (In Russ.).
4. Dashyan, K. P. (2021). Mirovaya turisticheskaya industriya v period pandemii COVID-19 i puti vyhoda iz neyo [The global travel industry during the covid-19 pandemic and ways out of it]. *Vestnik Akademii znaniy [The Bulletin of the Academy of Knowledge]*, 3(44), 86-92. doi: 10.24412/2304-6139-2022-11218. (In Russ.).
5. Degtyareva, I. V., Tokareva, G. F., & Shalina, O. I. (2016). Social'no-otvetstvennoe povedenie potrebitel'ev dlya dostizheniya celej ustojchivogo razvitiya: real'nost' ili mif [Socially responsible consumer behavior for sustainability goals achievement: myth or reality]. *Vestnik PNIPU. Social'no-ekonomicheskie nauki [PNIPU Sociology and Economics Bulletin]*, 3, 180-191. (In Russ.).
6. Zemskova, A. V., Bugorskij, V. N. (2014). Modelirovanie povedeniya potrebitel'ev uslug [Modeling service consumer behaviour]. *Nauchnyj zhurnal NIU ITMO. Seriya "Ekonomika i ekologicheskij menedzhment" [Scientific journal NRU ITMO. Series "Economics and Environmental Management"]*, 3, 183-191. (In Russ.).
7. Kashcheev, O. V., Usik, S. P., & Vingert, A. I. (2021). Otvetstvennoe potreblenie kak novaya paradigma kul'tury sovremennogo obshchestva [Responsible consumption as a new paradigm in modern society's culture]. *Vestnik slavyanskikh kul'tur [Bulletin of Slavic Cultures]*, 61, 127-135. doi: 10.37816/2073-9367-2021-61-127-20-135. (In Russ.).
8. Kormina, O. I. (2018). *Modelirovanie povedeniya potrebitel'ev [Modeling consumer behavior]: A textbook*. Toliatti: TSU Publ. (In Russ.).
9. Matova, N. I. (2017). Sociologicheskoe issledovanie stepeni, perspektiv i institucional'nykh predposylok razvitiya "zelenogo" turizma v nashej strane. Chast' I: metodologicheskie aspekty. Nekotorye rezul'taty oprosa [Methodological aspects of sociological research of degree, prospects and institutional preconditions of development of green tourism in Russia. Part I: The methodologies and tools. Some results of the survey]. *Sistemy kontrolya okruzhayushchej sredy [Monitoring systems of environment]*, 10(30), 136-143. (In Russ.).
10. Matova, N. I. (2018). Sociologicheskoe issledovanie stepeni, perspektiv i institucional'nykh predposylok razvitiya "zelenogo" turizma v nashej strane. Chast' III: potencial sprosa na "zelenyj" turprodukt i ocenka turistami ego predlozheniya [A sociological study of the degree, prospects and institutional prerequisites for the development of "green" tourism in our country. Part I: Methodological aspects. Some survey results]. *Sistemy kontrolya okruzhayushchej sredy [Monitoring systems of environment]*, 13(33), 115-122. (In Russ.).
11. Matova, N. I. (2020). Formirovanie otvetstvennogo turizma na OOPT [Fashioning responsible tourism in protected areas]. *Ustojchivoe razvitie osobo ohranyaemykh prirodnykh territorij [Sustainable development of protected natural areas]: The Collection of scientific articles based on the materials of the VII Scientific-Practical Conference*. Sochi: Natural Ornithological Park in the Imereti Lowland, 234-239. (In Russ.).
12. Matova, N. I., & Shagarov, L. M. (2021). Osobennosti ekologicheskogo otvetstvennogo povedeniya turistov na ohranyaemykh prirodnykh territoriyah [Special aspects of environmentally responsible behavior of tourists in protected areas]. *Sovremennye problemy servisa i turizma [Service and Tourism: Current Challenges]*, 15(1), 93-106. doi: 10.24412/1995-0411-2021-1-93-106. (In Russ.).

13. Medvedev, O. S. (2019). Osnovnye modeli potrebitel'skogo povedeniya v sovremennyh usloviyah [Basic models of consumer behavior in modern conditions]. *Vestnik Altajskoj akademii ekonomiki i prava [Bulletin of the Altai Academy of Economics and Law]*, 5(3), 88-93. (In Russ.).
14. Mitina, E. A. (2020). Teoreticheskie podhody k ponimaniyu sushchnosti otvetstvennogo potrebleniya [Theoretical approaches to understanding the essence of responsible consumption]. *Teoreticheskaya ekonomika [Theoretical economy]*, 1(61), 65-73. (In Russ.).
15. Onishchenko, E. V., & Slepchenko, V. A. (2021). Prirodno-rekreacionnyj potencial regiona: vozmozhnosti i perspektivy ispol'zovaniya v postpandemijnyj period [Natural and recreational potential of the region: opportunities and prospects of use in the post-pandemic period]. *Nauchnyj rezul'tat. Tekhnologii biznesa i servisa [Research result. Business and Service Technologies]*, 8(3), 40-54. doi: 10.18413/2408-9346-2021-7-3-0-4. (In Russ.).
16. Peters, M. (2021). *Transformaciya potrebitelya. Global'noe issledovanie potrebitel'skogo povedeniya za 2020 god: Rossiya [Transformation of the consumer. Global Study of Consumer Behavior for 2020: Russia]*. URL: pwc-global-customer-insights-survey-2020-russia-ru.pdf. (Accessed on October 03, 2021). (In Russ.).
17. Polozhihina, M. A. (2020). Evolyucii obshchestva potrebleniya: ot ZHaklin Kennedi do Greta Tunberg [The evolution of the consumer society: from Jacqueline Kennedy to Greta Thunberg]. *Social'nye novacii i social'nye nauki [Social Novelties and Social Sciences]*, 2, 7–36. doi: 10.31249/snsn/2020.02.01. (In Russ.).
18. Rassokhina, T. V., & Safonova, E.A (2021). Dinamicheskij analiz mnenij stejkholderov sfery turizma «Ocenka problem i perspektiv ustojchivogo razvitiya turizma v regionah Rossijskoj Federacii» za period 2015-2021 gody [Dynamic analysis of the opinions of stakeholders in the tourism sector "Assessment of the problems and prospects of sustainable tourism development in the regions of the Russian Federation" for the period 2015-2021]. *Turizm: nauka i obrazovanie [Tourism: Science and education]*: Materials of the VI International Forum in 2 parts, Khimki, April 21, 2021 / Russian International Academy of Tourism. Khimki: LLC "Literary Agency "University Book", 165-175. (In Russ.).
19. Serpova, K. I., Bobrysheva, O. R., & Ruban, D. A. (2018). Ekologizaciya industrii gostepriimstva v usloviyah transformacii potrebitel'skih predpochtenij: vzaimosvyaz' nacional'nyh i lichnostnyh interesov [Ecologization of hospitality industry in conditions of customer preferences transformation: relationship of national and personal interests]. *Vestnik Prikamskogo social'nogo instituta [Bulletin of Prikamsky Social Institute]*, 1(79), 101–108. (In Russ.).
20. Simonyan, G. A., & Saryan A. A. (2021). Osobennosti formirovaniya turistskih potokov v sovremennyh usloviyah [Features of the formation of tourist flows in modern conditions]. *Sovremennaya nauchnaya mysl' [Modern Scientific Thought]*, 2, 181-189. doi: 10.24412/2308-264X-2021-2-181-189. (In Russ.).
21. Snesar', D. (2021). «Zelenye» celi za global'nye sredstva ["Green" goals for global funds]. URL: www.vedomosti.ru (Accessed on November 3, 2021). (In Russ.).
22. Fedotov, V. (2021). Novye «magnity» glubinnnoj Rossii: kak privlech' rossijan v neturisticheskie mesta? [New "magnets" of deep Russia: how to attract Russians to non-tourist places?] URL: https://www.wciom.ru/V.Fedorov_Neturisticheskie_mesta.pdf (Accessed on November 1, 2021). (In Russ.).
23. Amonoy, M., Bantang, J., & Santos, K. (2021). Green Consumer Behavior Modeling of Selected Filipino Millennials. *Journal of Home Economics*, 28(1).
24. Bilbao-Terol, A., & Bilbao-Terol, C. (2020). Measuring the Economic Impact of Voluntary Sustainable Tourism Certification. *Sustainability*, 12(13), 5465. doi: 103390/su12135465.
25. Borges-Tiago, T., Silva, O., & Tiago, F. (2020). Sustainable Tourism in Europe from Tourists' Perspectives. In: Kavoura, A., Kefallonitis, E., Theodoridis, P. (Eds.) *Strategic Innovative Marketing and Tourism. Springer Proceedings in Business and Economics*. Springer, Cham. doi: 10.1007/978-3-030-36126-6_63.

26. Boronat-Navarro, M., & Pérez-Aranda, J. A. (2020). Analyzing Willingness to Pay More to Stay in a Sustainable Hotel. *Sustainability*, 12, 3730. doi: 10.3390/su12093730.
27. Cohen, S. A., Prayag, G., & Moital, M. (2014). Consumer behavior in tourism: Concepts, influences and opportunities. *Current Issues in Tourism*, 17(10), 872–909. doi: 10.1080/13683500.2013.850064.
28. Couto, J., Borges Tiago, M., Gil, A., Tiago, F., & Faria, S. (2016). It's hard to be green: Reverse green value chain. *Environmental Research*, 149. doi: 10.1016/j.envres.2016.05.006.
29. Ertz, M., Karakas, F., & Sarigöllü, E. (2016). Exploring pro-environmental behaviors of consumers: An analysis of contextual factors, attitude, and behaviors. *Journal of Business Research*, 69(10), 3971–3980. doi: 10.1016/j.jbusres.2016.06.010.
30. Gössling, S., & et al. (2012). Consumer behaviour and demand response of tourists to climate change. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 39(1), 36–58. doi: 10.1016/j.annals.2011.11.002.
31. Gössling S., Scott D., & Hall, C. M. (2021). Pandemics, tourism and global change: a rapid assessment of COVID-19. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 29:1, 1–20. doi: 10.1080/09669582.2020.1758708.
32. Halder, P., Hansen, E. N., Kangas, J., & Laukkanen, T. (2020). How national culture and ethics matter in consumers' green consumption values. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 265, 121754. doi: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2020.121754.
33. Han, H. (2020). Theory of green purchase behavior (TGPB): A new theory for sustainable consumption of green hotel and green restaurant products. *Business Strategy and the Environment*, 29(6), 2815–2828. doi: 10.1002/bse.2545.
34. Han, H. (2021). Consumer behavior and environmental sustainability in tourism and hospitality: a review of theories, concepts, and latest research. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 29(7), 1021–1042. doi: 10.1080/09669582.2021.1903019.
35. Krajhanzl, J. (2010). Environmental and pro-environmental behavior. In: E. Rehulka (Ed.). *School and health. Masarykova Univerzita, MSD*, 21, 251–274.
36. Mckercher, B., & Denizci, G. B., & Ng, E. (2012). Rethinking Loyalty. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 39, 708–734. doi: 10.1016/j.annals.2011.08.005.
37. Miniero, G., Codini, A., Bonera, M., Corvi, E., & Bertoli, G. (2014). Being green: from attitude to actual consumption. *International Journal of Consumer Studies*, 38, 521–528. doi: 10.1111/ijcs.12128.
38. Nova-Reyes, A., Muñoz-Leiva, F., & Luque-Martínez, T. (2020). The Tipping Point in the Status of Socially Responsible Consumer Behavior Research? A Bibliometric Analysis. *Sustainability*, 12, 3141. doi: 10.3390/su1208314.
39. O'Connor, P., & Assaker, G. (2021). COVID-19's effects on future pro-environmental traveler behavior: an empirical examination using norm activation, economic sacrifices, and risk perception theories. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*. doi: 10.1080/09669582.2021.1879821.
40. Passafaro, P., & et al. (2015). The "sustainable tourist": Values, attitudes, and personality traits. *Tourism and Hospitality Research*, 15(4), 225–239. doi: 10.1177/1467358415576086.
41. Scott, D. (2011). Why sustainable tourism must address climate change. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 19(1), 17–34. doi: 10.1080/09669582.2010.539694.